What is Social Marketing and how often does it imply an intervention?
A bibliometric analysis of published papers

Presented by
Divya Ramachandran

Co-Authors: Josephine Chau, Adrian Bauman

Prevention Research Collaboration, SPH
Introduction

– Much of the ‘mass media campaign’ literature in public health is now labelled as ‘social marketing’ (SM) although it rarely meets the criteria for SM campaigns.

– Much of the public health perception of social marketing is that it comprises mostly mass reach campaigns.

– Many in the (social) marketing field suggest that SM is widely used in public health and mass-reaching campaigns.

– This study assessed publications labelled ‘social marketing’ [in their title] and classified them to assess their public health relevant prevalence.
Methods

Scopus search:
• *Title search:* “Social Marketing”
• 1089 papers recovered \[N=1190 \text{ when repeated June 2017}\]

Inductive method to identify characteristics of papers (n = 100)
• what are the papers are about?
• were “social marketing” papers related to Public Health?
• what was the scale of published “social marketing” initiatives?
• was mass reach media (campaigns) used as a strategy?

Coding frame developed: classified on [i] type of paper, [ii] scale of the initiative; and whether mass reach media were used. [inter rater classification agreement =0.9 , sample of 68 papers; all resolved]
Types of Papers - broad categories of papers with “social marketing” in the title [Scopus]

1. Conceptual papers
2. Social marketing mass-reach public health campaigns
3. Social marketing interventions (without campaign)
4. Private sector social marketing
5. Formative studies
6. Research trials, small select sample RCTs
7. Systematic reviews
8. Economic papers
Methods

Figure 1: Publication selection

- 25% sample selected for coding
- All papers (n=95) from 1976 to 1991
- From 1992 till November 2016, 25% per year was selected as the sample (n=262).
- The total sample was n = 357. Duplicates (n=3), papers with no abstract (n=69) were excluded and the final sample for coding was n = 285
Results

Frequency of all documents using “Social Marketing” in the Title by Year (1971 – 2016) three-year smoothed average

89 documents each.
# Results [ii]

## Total Types of Papers with “Social Marketing” in the Title (1976 – 2016)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Paper</th>
<th>1976-1986 n(%)</th>
<th>1987-1996 n(%)</th>
<th>1997-2006 n(%)</th>
<th>2007-2016 n(%)</th>
<th>Total Frequency n(%), 95% CI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not Public Health</td>
<td>5 (20)</td>
<td>1 (2)</td>
<td>4 (11)</td>
<td>26 (16)</td>
<td>36 (13) [9,16]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conceptual</td>
<td>12 (48)</td>
<td>28 (49)</td>
<td>18 (49)</td>
<td>67 (40)</td>
<td>125 (44) [41,47]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Sector</td>
<td>7 (28)</td>
<td>11 (19)</td>
<td>2 (5)</td>
<td>10 (6)</td>
<td>30 (11) [7,14]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Campaigns</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(public health)</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>8 (14)</td>
<td>3 (8)</td>
<td>14 (8)</td>
<td>25 (9) [5,12]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SM Interventions</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>2 (5)</td>
<td>5 (3)</td>
<td>7 (2) [-1, 6]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research studies and trials</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>1 (2)</td>
<td>3 (8)</td>
<td>14 (8)</td>
<td>18 (6) [3,10]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formative and Pilot Studies</td>
<td>1 (4)</td>
<td>8 (14)</td>
<td>5 (14)</td>
<td>23 (14)</td>
<td>37 (13) [10, 16]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economics</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>4 (2)</td>
<td>4 (1) [-2,5]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Systematic Reviews</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>3 (2)</td>
<td>3 (1) [-2,4]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>25 (100)</td>
<td>57 (100)</td>
<td>37 (100)</td>
<td>166 (100)</td>
<td>285 (100)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Sensitivity Analysis – we used ‘title=social marketing’, but how many studies might we have missed as ‘Keyword=social marketing’?

SM “title” = 29% [focus of this analysis]

discordant “title (-)” and keyword (+)

Next stage of this research will be to corroborate in this sample
Conclusions

– This study shows that very little [9% (95%CI - 5%,12%)] of the published research which is social marketing are public health campaigns

– This is contrary to the widely held view that most social marketing comprises ‘mass media public health campaigns’

– Over half of “Social marketing” publications are conceptual papers, opinion pieces, reviews, formative studies

– The remainder are behavioural interventions, pilot RCTs and other selected sample behavioural-outcomes research

– The term “social marketing” is currently fashionable, but may be misnomer in describing actual public health programs
Thank You
Appendix
Types of Papers - Definitions

**Conceptual paper:** Papers that are commentaries, reviews, opinion pieces, or discussions; papers that provide conceptual models, methods, and theory about social marketing.

- A hierarchical model of social marketing
- The social marketing theory-based (SMT) approach for designing interventions
- Pleasure: An under-utilised ‘P’ in social marketing for healthy eating

**Campaign:** Population or large scale programs: to promote public health, where mass reach communication is used, either on its own, or as one of the strategies in a multi-component initiative. (such as mass reach campaigns using television, radio, newsletters, billboards, pamphlets; information is pushed to the population).

- Project LEAN (Low-Fat Eating for America Now)- Lessons learned from a national social marketing campaign
- Increasing tobacco quitline calls from pregnant African American women: The "one tiny reason to quit" social marketing campaign
- The impact of social marketing campaigns on reducing mental health stigma: Results from the 2009–2014 Time to Change programme
- Promoting HIV risk awareness and testing in latinos living on the U.S.-Mexico border: The Tú No Me Conoces social marketing campaign
Types of Papers - Definitions

**Intervention:** Large scale programs that promote public health and are similar in scale with campaigns described above. However, *mass reach communication is not used as a strategy* in these initiatives.

- Project FIT: A School, Community and Social Marketing Intervention Improves Healthy Eating Among Low-Income Elementary School Children
- Clean Hands for Life™: results of a large, multicentre, multifaceted, social marketing hand-hygiene campaign
- Use of social marketing to increase water consumption among school-age children in Mexico City
Types of Papers [cont.]

Private Sector: private sector “social marketing” papers, focus on supply, distribution, sales and subsidies of products such as contraceptives, insecticide treated nets, ORS (oral rehydration salts), other pharmaceuticals so on. Private sector [for profit] organisations [with social / health benefit, in partnership with Government or NGOs]. Usually large scale, implemented at national or regional levels.

• The social marketing of contraceptives in Mexico
• Socio-economic factors associated with the purchasing of insecticide-treated nets in Afghanistan and their implications for social marketing
• In rural Indonesia social marketing of oral rehydration salts the mothers' perspective
Types of Papers [cont.]

Formative assessment and Pilot Studies: These papers describe research that contributes to the development of a social marketing campaign or intervention. Qualitative studies, focus groups, audience analysis, surveys, pilot trials and other methods used for formative analysis are included.

- 'You just change the channel if you don't like what you're going to hear': gamblers' attitudes towards, and interactions with, social marketing campaigns
- Feasibility of incorporating a social marketing nutrition module for child survival into education curricula in Ghana
- A rapid assessment and its implications for a needle social marketing intervention among injecting drug users in China
- Development of the Oxford Hills Healthy Moms Project using a social marketing process: a community-based physical activity and nutrition intervention for low-socioeconomic-status mothers in a rural area in Maine
Types of Papers [cont.]

Research Studies and Trials: These are research trials for hypothesis testing, determining efficacy or effectiveness, and typically small scale compared with campaigns and interventions. For example, they are trialled in one campus, or with selected volunteers, using a range of study designs (through to quasi-experimental studies and RCTs).

- A clustered randomised trial examining the effect of social marketing and community mobilisation on the age of uptake and levels of alcohol consumption by Australian adolescents
- Social marketing of nutrition education to cardiac patients in acute care
- Using social marketing to increase the use of helmets among bicyclists
Types of Papers [cont.]

**Systematic Reviews:** Systematic reviews of campaigns, social marketing interventions or programs

- Eating for the better: A social marketing review (2000-2012)
- Minimizing alcohol harm: A systematic social marketing review (2000-2014)

**Economics:** papers on behavioural economics; funding and sponsorship

- Financing social marketing programs through sponsorship: Implications for evaluation
- Cost of providing injectable contraceptives through a community-based social marketing program in Tigray, Ethiopia